

IN SEARCH OF TRANSCULTURAL MEMORY IN EUROPE

ISTME WORKING PAPER N.2/2013



RETHINKING REMEDIATION AND REWORKING THE ARCHIVE: TRANSCULTURAL REAPPROPRIATIONS OF DOCUMENTARY IMAGES OF MIGRATION

Dagmar Brunow



ABSTRACT

Arguing that the relation between documentary images and the dynamics of cultural memory needs to be theorized more fully, the article readdresses the concepts of the 'archive' and 'remediation'. The article examines how archival newsreel footage from the now iconic arrival of the Windrush in Britain in 1948 is remediated on YouTube. It suggests that remediations of documentary images can be used to acknowledge the cultural memory of migration, and, more specifically, the legacy of Black immigration and its impact on contemporary Britain. In order to understand the remediation of cultural memory and its inherent power structures, the article argues, we need to analyse its media specificity, its genre, the politics of representation at work, its discursive as well as its industrial context (production, distribution and exhibition).

The article also discusses the remediation of archival footage as a possible way to rework a colonial and Eurocentric perspective. Critical interrogations into the archive can create alternative and vernacular memories which might offer emancipatory potential instead of stabilizing essentialist notions of belonging. This perspective could allow cultural memory studies to get away from essentializing concepts of cultural or transcultural memory as based on the notions of container cultures.

RETHINKING REMEDIATION AND REWORKING THE ARCHIVE: TRANSCULTURAL REAPPROPRIATIONS OF DOCUMENTARY IMAGES OF MIGRATION

DAGMAR BRUNOW, LINNEAUS UNIVERSITY, VÄXJÖ & HAMBURG UNIVERSITY

A piece of black and white archive footage shows a white British reporter interviewing the Trinidadian Calypso singer Lord Kitchener and asking him to perform a song right into the camera. Kitchener accordingly performs an a capella version of his calypso “London is the Place for me”. This scene, taking place on June 22, 1948 when Kitchener was about to disembark from the SS Empire Windrush docking at Tilbury, is part of a newsreel produced by British Pathé.¹ Throughout the years the newsreel footage of the arrival of the Windrush has become part of the cultural memory of post-war migration to Britain.

The arrival of the SS Empire Windrush in Britain in June 1948 is now commonly regarded as the starting point of post-war immigration to Britain and has been described as a foundation myth of multi-cultural Britain (Mead, 2007). Today ‘the Windrush generation’ has become a household term, commonly denoting what is thought to be the ‘first generation’ of Black immigrants to Britain.²

¹ On its homebound voyage from Australia the SS Empire Windrush had passed the Caribbean where 492 cheap tickets had been sold to West Indians looking for a job in the ‘mother-country’, many of them ex-servicemen who had fought for Britain during the Second World War. In those days immigration was not policed: before the Commonwealth Immigration Act was imposed in 1962 to restrict further immigration of Black and Asian Britons, the citizens of the colonies of the British Empire held British passports which allowed them to settle in the British ‘motherland’. Still, the authorities were alarmed by reports of several hundred Black Caribbeans coming to Britain and reports about the Windrush resulted in racist attacks by some politicians (Phillips/Phillips, 1998; Dabydeen et al, 2007). For a discussion of the number 492, see Mead 2009.

² The iconic status of the Windrush, however, is not unproblematic since its lack of a diachronic perspective tends to neglect the long-standing Black presence in Britain which dates back to the 15th century. Since then

Meanwhile the archival footage of the Windrush can be accessed via YouTube and has been remediated widely. Among others it has been included in documentaries, both for mainstream television, community channels or for user-generated videos uploaded on YouTube. This has not always been the case, as Korte/Pirker (2011, p. 27) point out: “before the late 1990s, the Windrush had practically slipped from Britain's historical consciousness”.

Remediation (in the understanding of Astrid Erll, not of Bolter/Grusin³) and its dynamics therefore opens up to various modes of theorizing around the relation of documentary (moving) images, cultural memory and the visual archive of migration. As Stuart Hall has shown in his 1991 article “Reconstruction Work” using the example of photographs representing Black Britons, each new dissemination also adds new layers of meaning to the images. The meaning of these images is therefore not stable, but changes whenever the images are recontextualised, for instance through renewed circulation. Thus, they can have different functions for cultural memory. Mediated memories of migration can be appropriated by specific groups, for example by Black Britons in order to acknowledge the presence of Blacks in Britain. They can be translated into different transcultural contexts, but their meaning can also shift within the hegemonic discourse, as the Windrush-example

Black communities have existed in London, Cardiff, Bristol and Liverpool, among others. As Barnor Hesse criticizes: “the prevailing narratives of contemporary Black settlement in Britain tend to relegate the earlier part of the twentieth century to the shelf of curiosity studies, while suggesting that matters of real historical interest take place in the middle to late twentieth century.” (Hesse 2000:103) The Windrush topos has also marginalizes the fact that tens of thousands of Caribbeans volunteered to fight for Britain in the two World Wars. Moreover, the Windrush was not even the first ship to bring Black workers to Britain. In 1947 the Ormonde had hundreds of Caribbean labour migrants on board, but went completely unnoticed by the media (cf. Korte/Pirker 2011: 27, fn. 15). What is also forgotten is the presence of over 60 Polish displaced persons onboard the Windrush (see Mead, 2009).

³ The concept of remediation goes back to David Jay Bolter and Richard Grusin who examine “the formal logic by which new media refashion prior media forms” (Bolter/Grusin 1999, p. 273), for example paintings being remediated in photographs, television remediating radio or theatre. Astrid Erll and Ann Rigney (2009) have applied and developed the concept of remediation for cultural memory studies: “Just as there is no cultural memory prior to mediation, there is no mediation without remediation: all representations of the past draw on available media technologies, on existent media products, on patterns of representation and medial aesthetics.” (Erll and Rigney, 2009: 4)

shows: from being used to illustrate a threat to the nation towards acknowledging the existence of multi-cultural Britain. The cultural memory of migration in Britain does not belong to individual groups, but is entangled and multi-directional.

In this paper I will take a closer look at the remediation of the Windrush footage and the ways it is being re-appropriated. In what ways can archival footage be used to acknowledge the Black past in Britain and to carve out discursive spaces for Black British cultural memory? While I argue that cultural memory does not belong to specific groups, I am interested in the multidirectionality of cultural memory (Rothberg, 2009) and the ways it translates into different contexts. Freeing the concept of 'transculturality' from its prevalent focus on ethnicity and nationality, we could also speak of a travelling memory (Erll, 2011b) which translates into different transcultural contexts (that is: different cultural and subcultural formations *within* the nation which are not solely defined by ethnicity and the notion of container cultures).⁴ Looking at the way archival footage is translated, reclaimed and remixed, is also a way to grant agency to subjects (migrants) whose access to dominant media production has been limited.⁵

The aim of this paper is twofold: first, to contribute to theorizing about the mediation of migrant memory and the role of documentary images and archival footage. Second, to further conceptualize the notion of remediation. This paper sets out to examine in what ways the archival footage of the arrival of the Windrush can be used, appropriated or reworked in order to diversify the cultural memory of the nation and in order to acknowledge the legacy of Black immigration and its impact on contemporary Britain. In looking at various remediations of the footage available on YouTube, I am

⁴ I have explained elsewhere why I still prefer the term 'cultural' rather than 'transcultural' memory in the context of migration - basically because the notion of 'trans' tends to re-essentialize the concept of culture. In order not to re-establish a concept of culture as fixed container-culture(s) with clearly outlined borders (something that the transcultural turn set out to leave behind), I use the term 'cultural memory' based on an understanding of 'culture' suggested by the representatives of Black British Cultural Studies, such as Stuart Hall, Homi Bhabha and Paul Gilroy: as inherently hybrid, as constantly in flux and in progress, defying essentialist notions of nation, race, ethnicity, class or gender. (see also Erll, 2011b; Welsch, 1999; Schulze-Engler, 2008)

⁵ The notion of agency is something that John Sundholm stresses in his current work on migrant filmmaking in Sweden and I am grateful to him for reminding me of the importance of this concept.

going to take the media specificity of the cultural memory of migration and its different forms of mediation (mediatization) into account.

Yet, I argue that we not only have to analyse the media specificity of these visual representations and their roles as performative acts, but also their specific discursive context. Only then can we get away from concepts of cultural or transcultural memory as static and fixed, as based on the notions of container culture and belonging to one specific group. Instead, I would like to show how mediated memories of migration travel (Erll, 2011b), how new layers of meaning are added to them and how they can be translated, reclaimed, reworked and re-appropriated.

MEDIATED MEMORIES OF MIGRATION: DOCUMENTARY IMAGES AND THE ISSUE OF REPRESENTATION

Looking at the mediation of memory implies that mediatization is regarded not only as an 'outlet' of memory, but as its prerequisite. Marita Sturken describes media as "technologies of memory, not vessels of memory in which memory passively resides" (1997, 9). Also Aleida Assmann (2011) has pointed at the fact that cultural memory is defined by the kind of media available in a society at a given point in time. And Astrid Erll paraphrases Marshall Mc Luhan's famous dictum "the medium is the message" when she states "the medium is the memory" (Erll, 2011a, p. 115). Thus, when analysing mediated memories the specific media technologies, the modes of production, distribution and exhibition will have to be examined. Since cultural memory is always mediated and cannot be accessed outside its mediatizations, other forms of media, such as documentaries, essay films, videos or user-generated YouTube clips should be considered as being of equal importance for the transmission, translation and reworking of mediated memories of migration as fiction films or written sources.

Analysing documentary images, however, requires a specifically critical perspective. Due to their indexical relation to 'reality', documentary images are often considered a source of factual, positive knowledge. Therefore, conventional documentaries tend to use archival footage as a means of authentication, as visible evidence to show "how it really was" ("wie es einst gewesen") in the sense of Ranke. However, this misunderstanding of the ontology of the image has been problematized within documentary film theory (Minh-ha, Steyerl), in essay-films (Marker, Akomfrah, Varda) and in theoretical writings on photography (e.g. Barthes, Sontag, Hall, Sekula). Moreover, image making cannot be conceptualised outside relations of power: whose is the gaze of the camera? What perspective do we find in the images? In what way does it reproduce a colonial or Eurocentric view?

Who is entitled to make pictures of others and to publish and disseminate them? Who has the prerogative of interpretation over these images? Therefore, we have to regard documentary images not as exact copies of 'reality', but as representations and thus as constructs which are the result of entangled discourses, of iconographic traditions, narrative formula and specific media technologies and their dispositifs.

What does it mean to speak of mediated memories of migration? First, we have to consider the fact that in most cases the migrants represented in the films or news reports have not been the producers of the footage. Since migrants have only had limited access to media production (with few exceptions), they are often the ones talked about and described by others - more often than not represented from the standpoint of the mainstream society. As a result, the representation of migration (immigration) has often been guided by discourses of 'threat' to the nation, by rhetoric of 'flood', by the use of increasing numbers when referring to migrants. The footage, both the images and the soundtrack, is likely to be dominated by a Eurocentric perspective through which migrants are 'othered'. Ways of 'othering' migrants or ethnic minorities are for instance the mode in which they are framed within the picture, the *mise-en-scène*, the use of camera angle and the modes of lighting.⁶ When we examine the footage, we could, for example, ask the following questions: are migrants or ethnic minorities allowed to speak? Will they be allowed a close-up? Are they mentioned by name? Or are they just filmed in long shots as a big group? We should also keep in mind the importance of articulation and focalization, as Shohat/Stam remind us: "Who is speaking through a film? Who is imagined as listening? Who is actually listening? Who is looking? And what social desires are mobilized by the film?" (Shohat/Stam, 1994, p. 205) Taking a closer look at the stylistic means employed in the archival footage acknowledges the construction of memory by the media and the dynamics of power at work. The politics of representation is also related to the genre of the film, for instance the different forms of documentary filmmaking, such as the newsreel, the essay film, the home movie or the video diary.

Mediated memories of migration can only have an impact on the construction of contemporary cultural memory if they are liberated from the archives and given a chance to be freed from forgetting. In short, if they change from being what Aleida Assmann terms 'storage memory' (which can be described as dead memory) to becoming working memory (which implies living memory) (cf Assmann, 2008). Therefore they need to be remediated and have to be circulated again and again, for

⁶ For more examples, see Shohat/Stam 1994, p. 204 ff.

example via novels, TV-series and documentaries, exhibitions or online platforms, such as YouTube, Flickr or Tumblr. The remediation of these images can enable them to become part of the 'working memory' in a specific socio-historical context, instead of being relegated to an existence of a shelf in the archive. As Erll states, "remediation tends to solidify cultural memory, creating and stabilizing certain narratives and icons of the past" (Erll 2008, p. 393). However, while memory studies has hitherto focussed on popular genres and mainstream cultural practice (Erll, 2009; Rigney, 2012) I would like to take a look at the remediation of archival newsreel footage, since the archive is the foundation of how and in what ways history is written. Or, as Stuart Hall has put it: "The past cannot speak, except through its 'archive'." (Hall 1991, p. 152)

THE NOTION OF THE ARCHIVE

Since the notion of the archive is entangled with the workings of cultural memory (see also A. Assmann, 2008) I will briefly introduce three conceptualisations of the archive relevant for memory studies. (1) The archive as a discursive construct which is pervaded by power relations (as theorized by Derrida, 1995 and Foucault, 1972), or (2) as a film (or television) archive storing film or newsreel footage (as theorized by Giovanna Fossati (2009), for example). The division is merely heuristic, though, since the decisions as to what stock is kept, thrown away, preserved, restored and remediated, are guided by hegemonic discourses. Therefore I would like to introduce a third concept which merges the first two: (3) the visual archive which I define as *the images circulating in public at a specific sociohistorical moment*. What images are allowed to circulate - which ones are encouraged, and which ones are restricted? The circulation of images can be restricted due to censorship or property rights issues, but also due to hegemonic discourses prioritizing certain representations of race, gender, class or sexuality.⁷ The function of the soundtrack should not be underestimated: the accompanying sound (voice-over, music) guides the interpretation of the images by the recipient, it can prescribe a 'preferred meaning' (Hall), even if, as Stuart Hall has convincingly shown, alternative and contradicting interpretations are possible.

However, despite its discursivity, the visual archive is a result of materiality, of the images that can be accessed within the public sphere: on YouTube, in national film archives, in commercial archives of

⁷ Another factor would be legal issues, such as the criminalisation of certain groups, for example homosexuals, which kept photographic images of lesbian or gay lives in the realms of the private sphere.

production companies (from Pathé to Universal). All these archives, their legal politics, their handling of the stock (whether it is to be preserved, restored or thrown away) determine what kind of images are disseminated. Nowadays, digital archives such as Facebook or Flickr, which challenge the division between private and public, contribute to the visual archive as well (see Van Dijck, 2007; Garde-Hansen, 2011).

THE ARCHIVAL FOOTAGE: THE PATHÉ NEWSREEL OF THE ARRIVAL OF THE WINDRUSH (1948)

The 1948 British Pathé footage of the arrival of the SS Empire Windrush in Tilbury is about one minute long, but it comes in a package with a newsreel clip on Ingrid Bergman's visit to Britain under the title "Pathe Reporter Meets". Very likely the two news stories have been screened in this order. In those years before the introduction of television, newsreels would be screened in the cinemas before the main feature film. A newsreel would consist of short clips about specific political and historical events, sports events and some entertainment. Pathé was one of the leading companies at that time, producing newsreels in several countries to be screened at Pathé-owned cinema chains.⁸ For many decades, until digitised film footage could be uploaded on the internet, the access to the newsreel footage stored in the Pathé archives was restricted. It was mainly targeted at professionals who would have to pay for the use of the footage. Due to these circumstances the remediation of the Windrush footage was limited and its impact on the cultural memory of migration can be said to have been fairly minimal. Instead, the visual archive of migration was dominated by photographs of West Indian migrants circulating in newspapers and magazines (see Hall, 1991). Since the digitisation of the British Pathé archives in 2002 the Windrush newsreel footage is available online, both on the Pathé website and on YouTube.⁹

The footage of the arrival of the Windrush starts with a long shot of the ship in a harbour and continues using long shots showing crowds of immigrants onboard, standing crammed along the rails.

⁸ The production company Pathé, founded in Paris in 1896, opened a branch in London in 1902, while acquiring a chain of cinemas as well.

⁹ The clip, accessible at the website of British Pathé (www.britishpathe.com), is called "Pathe Reporter Meets". It can be acquired for download as a wmv-file (Windows Media Video) at a resolution of 24 bits, for personal use only, at a prize of £30, inc. VAT.

The establishing shots are followed by a sequence in which a white reporter conducts interviews with three of the passengers.¹⁰ In a classical “voice-of-God”-manner the authoritarian male voice-over, speaking standard English, would comment on the pictures, thereby framing their reception by directing the audience towards a ‘dominant reading’ (Hall) as he is offering an interpretation of the images. The perspective of the clip is targeted towards an audience living in Britain and imagined to be white.

The Windrush footage is preceded by a sequence depicting Ingrid Bergman’s visit to Britain. The footage contains a dialogue with director Alfred Hitchcock who asks her questions. The clip ends with a close-up of Bergman’s face, while the voice-over states: “The Swedish-born actress wearing no make-up, yet being lovelier than Hollywood has pictured her, has come over here to star in a British film.” The close up is intercut with a long shot of a ship in a harbour. Without a break the voice-over continues, now accompanying footage of the arrival of the Windrush at Tilbury: “Arrivals at Tilbury. The Empire Windrush brings to Britain 500 Jamaicans. Many are ex-servicemen who know England. They served this country well. In Jamaica they couldn’t find work. Discouraged, but full of hope, they sailed for Britain. Citizens of the British Empire coming to the mother country with good intent. [...] Our reporter asks them what they want to do.” Reporter: “Now, why do you come to England.” Migrant: “To seek a job.” Reporter: “And what sort of job do you want?” Migrant: “Any type as long as I get a good pay.” Then the voice-over continues: “Some will go into industry, others intend to rejoin the services.” An interview with an ex-serviceman follows. The voice-over states: “Some intend to return to Jamaica [sic!] when conditions improve.” Another interview features a West Indian man who explains that he came to England to support his family. Finally, the reporter interviews calypso singer Lord Kitchener, the only interviewee who is mentioned by name.¹¹

¹⁰ A description of the clip “Pathe Reporter Meets” can be found on the Pathé website. The given length of 169 seconds includes the Bergman-Hitchcock-sequence.

¹¹ The dialogue develops as follows: *Reporter*: “May I ask your name?” *Lord Kitchener*: “Lord Kitchener.” *Reporter*: „Lord Kitchener. Now I am told that you are really *the* king of Calypso singers. Is that right?” *Lord Kitchener*: [*barely understandable as the reporter keeps on talking*] “Yes, that’s true.” *Reporter*: “Will you sing for us?” *Lord Kitchener*: “Right now?” *Reporter*: “Yes.” [*Lord Kitchener sings an a capella version of his calypso “London is the Place for Me” before the clip stops.*]

Especially in contrast with the previous newsreel clip showing Ingrid Bergman meeting Hitchcock on arrival in Britain we can see the modes of ‘othering’ at work in the Windrush clip. While Ingrid Bergman is represented as an individual whose coming to Britain is justified by her professional role as an actress, the passengers of the Windrush are represented as a homogenous group, as “500 Jamaicans”, according to the voice-over.¹² The use of long shots lumps the most diverse individuals together into seemingly homogenous groups, while having the tendency to distance the spectators from the immigrants. In the subsequent interview sequences - despite the use of medium shots - the interviewees are not named, with the exception of Lord Kitchener. Even here, though, if we look at the politics of representation from a historical perspective, we can state that Lord Kitchener singing into the camera being asked by a white person to do so ties into a long legacy of colonial images.¹³

Overall, the interviewees are confined to the limitations of the interview situation, having to react to the question asked by the reporter. Most likely the interviews have been rehearsed beforehand. As film stock was expensive, talks would occur in advance in order to select potential interviewees and to brief both them and the reporter. Especially the interview sequence with Lord Kitchener shows that the reporter has obtained some information in advance: “Now I am told that you are really *the* king of Calypso singers.” No discursive space for a possible self-representation is carved out: the migrant cannot tell his own story, but has to articulate himself within an already given (Eurocentric) framework in which his role is reduced to an extra. Hence, the following questions arise: how can remediation contribute to translating the footage into other contexts? How have the archival images been reclaimed by different groups? Have the images - at least partly - been liberated from their white Eurocentric perspective? Before I look at examples of reworking archival footage, we will have to take a closer look at the notion of remediation and its preconditions.

¹² As historical research has shown, neither the number of the immigrants stated here nor their geographical origin are accurate. See Mead, 2007; Dabydeen et al, 2007; Schwarz, 2007; Mead, 2009.

¹³ As Bill Schwarz suggests: “The first social act in Windrush Britain is for a white man to ask a black man to sing” (Schwarz, 2007, p. 7) and in 1988 Reece Auguiste, member of the Black Audio Film Collective, who reworked the footage in the essay-film *Handsworth Songs*, describes the scene such: “The sad irony of Lord Kitchener’s words ‘London is the place for me’. Kitchener standing on the deck, nervous, shaking, but desperately trying to keep the calypso rhythm together; Prospero want to hear so Caliban must continue to sing it.” (Auguiste, 2007).

WHAT TRIGGERS REMEDIATION? PREMEDIATION (ICONOGRAPHY AND NARRATIVE) AND DISCURSIVE CHANGES AS A CONDITION FOR REMEDIATION

In the years following the arrival of the SS Empire Windrush the number of Caribbean immigrants remained comparably low. As a consequence the British media lost interest in the Black migrants who in turn had to cope with everyday racism which went unnoticed within the predominantly white public sphere (cf. Phillips and Phillips, 1998). During the 1950s, however, despite its low numbers, immigration from the Commonwealth countries was increasingly regarded as a problem in the public discourse, culminating in the Commonwealth Immigrants Act of 1962 which regulated immigration from the colonies. As Barnor Hesse (2000, 98) notes, “[f]or forty-nine years *Windrush* signified in the public sphere the problem of ‘race’ and the racialized other.” The debate on immigration was guided by a white British perspective, from which Black or Asian migration would be described as a potential threat. For instance, migrants would be referred to in numbers, combining these (increasing numbers) with rhetoric of ‘flood’ or ‘waves’, culminating in Enoch Powell’s “Rivers of Blood” speech on 20 April 1968 and in Margaret Thatcher’s notorious 1978 television interview for current affairs programme *WORLD IN ACTION* about Britain being “swamped” by immigrants. While these racist discourses still exist today, most outspokenly in populist right-wing rhetoric, a discursive shift has occurred in hegemonic politics since New Labour’s proclamation of Britain as a multicultural society.¹⁴

Since the late 1990s the Windrush footage has been remediated widely, thus turning the Windrush into an icon.¹⁵ In 1998 the BBC series “Windrush” was one of the first media events which brought

¹⁴ Of course the notion of multi-culturalism is highly problematic, especially if it is based on a concept of container cultures, which are homogenous and clearly demarcated and which are to co-exist in a given society. However, I will not discuss the concept of multi-culturalism and its pitfalls here, but would like to stress that the British (New Labour) conceptualisation of multi-culturalism can also be understood in terms of hybridity rather than ‘cultures’, and of a multitude of heterogeneous cultural practices, not connected to an essentialist understanding of ‘nation’ or ‘race’, but one which takes the various intersections of identity into account.

¹⁵ For several decades the footage would only rarely be employed in films or exhibitions. One notable exception would be the essay-film *Handsworth Songs* by the Black Audio Film Collective in 1986 (see also Brunow, 2011). According to Spence/Navarro (2011, 50), the Lord Kitchener sequence was also included in a documentary on calypso “One Hand Don’t Clap” by Kavery Dutta (1989).

the experiences of the 'Windrush generation' into the public sphere and reached broader audiences. The series assembles testimonial interviews with historical witnesses, but also with Black British historians and cultural critics (such as Stuart Hall), as well as archival footage. Both the highly popular series and the accompanying book *Windrush. The Irresistible Rise of Multi-Racial Britain* by Mike and Trevor Phillips (Phillips and Phillips 1998) created a 'plurimedial constellation' (Erll) which helped to carve out a discursive space for migrant memory. In the same year, Channel 4 aired its series *The Windrush Years*. The Museum of London celebrated the 50th anniversary of the arrival of the Windrush in the exhibition "Windrush - Sea Change" in 1998.¹⁶ The exhibition included contemporary film footage, most probably the Pathé newsreel. In 1998 The Essex Record Office created an entry in their sound archive called "Radio recordings: Windrush Archive".¹⁷ 1998 also saw the publication of another oral history account: *With Hope in their Eyes*, edited by Vivian Francis, is a collection of interviews with Windrush passengers. Through its remediation, its recurrent circulation in various media formats, the Windrush topos has entered cultural memory. Over the years the Windrush topos was employed in exhibitions and musicals as well as in televised crime series, such as *Foyles War* (ITV, 2002) and *Jericho* (ITV, 2005), or in Andrea Levy's bestselling novel *Small Island* (2004), which in turn was adapted into a popular television drama in 2009 (see Korte/Pirker, 2011, pp. 183-250). How come the Windrush topos proved so suitable for remediation? We can explain this phenomenon, at least partly, with the help of the concept of premediation (Erll).

The Windrush could become an iconic symbol because it has been premediated via another national icon with symbolic value: the white cliffs of Dover, famously depicted in Ford Maddox Brown's painting THE LAST OF ENGLAND (which in turn gave the title to Derek Jarman's 1987 film). The painting, which shows a couple in a small vessel facing the spectator while the white cliffs of Dover can be spotted in the background, was created in the years 1852 to 1855, "at the height of a period of mass emigration from the British Isles to the British colonies" (Kuhn 2002, 130). As such, the Windrush footage becomes emblematic for a reversal in the national self-understanding: from

¹⁶ For the first time the passenger list, now held at the Public Record Office, was on display.

¹⁷ It is 19 minutes 47 seconds long and consists of six recordings, among them sound files from British Pathé. It uses the index terms "Migration" and "Racism" under the reference code: SA 1/1962/1. The copyright is held by BBC Essex 1998.

emigration to immigration.¹⁸ Immigration, usually sidelined and marginalised in national historiography, is now part of the national master narrative in Britain. One of the latest examples of including the Windrush into the national master narrative would be Danny Boyle's opening ceremony for the 2012 Olympics in London. During the show a huge model of the Windrush entered the stage, accompanied by numerous extras dressed in the iconic outfit of the Windrush generation: smart dresses and gloves, suits and hats. Thus, the Windrush topos, being a symbol for multi-cultural Britain, is adding a new dimension to the notion of heritage in which British identity is imagined as solely white and homogenous.

Remediation cannot be explained by premediation alone, though. The reason why the arrival of the Windrush became iconic cannot be found solely in its iconic and narratological conditions. For example, in the 1984 television series „A Passage to Britain“ (Channel 4), the Windrush is not even mentioned (see Korte/Pirker 2011, 35). There has to be a “readiness” in the hegemonic discourse to allow these images to enter the public arena and thus into the visual archive. New Labour's redefinition of Britain as a multi-cultural society helped pave the way for this development, although it is not the only reason for the discursive shift from regarding migration as a problem to acknowledging multi-cultural Britain. Especially since the late 1980s Black Britons have been negotiating their identity as Black AND British in many sectors (literature, audiovisual media, music). Therefore the discursive shift did not come out of thin air.

From the mid-1990s the idea of Britain as a multicultural society has gained a wider appeal within the public sphere. While both everyday racism, racist attacks in the streets as well as structural racism, for example within the police and other authorities, are still part of reality, various measures have been taken to acknowledge the diversity within the British population.¹⁹ For example, school curricula would be changed, museum and galleries would change their permanent exhibitions, libraries would expand their stock, the book market would increasingly publish literature by Black British or Asian British writers and the media (both radio and television) would represent

¹⁸ Although the Windrush did not dock in Dover, but in Tilbury, I would claim that the notion of Britain as an island, with its coastline as the border, is a topos which capitalizes on the symbolic value of the white cliffs of Dover.

¹⁹ This is remarkable insofar as this discursive shift has not yet happened in other Western European countries, for instance in Germany.

multicultural Britain to a higher degree than ever before. No matter if some of these measures have been due to social engineering (school curricula) and others merely the result of market considerations (publishing) or both (museum politics) - in effect, the hegemonic discourse in Britain tends towards acknowledging the existence of a multicultural society. The 50th anniversary triggered remediations of the Windrush, and so did the 60th, and most recently the 65th anniversary. Yet, the fact that the Windrush anniversaries are celebrated is also a result of political changes in Britain's historical programme, towards promoting 'multiethnicity' (cf. Korte/Pirker 2011).

DIGITAL ARCHIVES OF MIGRATION: RECLAIMING, REAPPROPRIATING AND REMAKING MEDIATED MEMORIES OF MIGRATION - THE WINDRUSH TOPOS ON YOUTUBE

I will use the example of YouTube as a digital archive of migration, because in contrast to official archives, such as the archive(s) of the British Film Institute or the archives of the BBC, Channel 4 or ITV, it allows for user-generated material to be uploaded and reworked to a greater extent. While its impact on cultural memory is probably lower - obviously, a YouTube clip with 5000 hits has a lesser impact than a TV series broadcast on the BBC, with an audience of a million - YouTube as a digital archive contains remediations of the Windrush footage which (might) allow for a higher degree of self-representation than the footage contained in official film and television archives due to the limited access of Black Britons to media production (see Malik, 2002). While the notion of self-representation is not unproblematic per se, the user-generated clips can tell us a great deal about the ways cultural memory travels and how it is reworked and remediated.

To what extent can we actually call YouTube an archive? While YouTube clearly lacks some of an archive's most important tasks, such as preservation and restoration, it is commonly perceived as an archive and can teach us about the workings of archives in general.²⁰ Indeed, the video platform is not sustainable and its politics of preservation are highly erratic. All of a sudden a clip might disappear, being removed by the users for personal reasons or due to alleged copyright infringements or other legal reasons. Therefore, the content on YouTube is in constant flux, is continuously reworked and re-

²⁰ See Snickars/Vonderau, 2009, especially the contribution by Kessler/Schäfer, Prelinger, Snickars and Schröter.

edited. Nevertheless, YouTube is not only a video platform, it is indeed an archive, giving access to hitherto forgotten or inaccessible TV shows, children's programmes, music video clips, bootlegged concert recordings or interviews. It allows users to digitise their old videos (VHS or other formats) and to make them accessible - at least for a certain period of time. YouTube is also an archive of first person filmmaking, of confessional videos, make-up tutorials and manuals, as well as an archive of viral videos and their remixes, illustrating the transnational and transcultural translations and appropriations of global media.

The YouTube clips I look at are not only those which rework the Windrush newsreel footage. Some of the examples I will mention set out to preserve the cultural memory of the Windrush generation. Without using the archival footage, they record testimonial witness interviews which they then disseminate via YouTube. In these examples I would like to examine the impact of media specificity. Is this only a vessel in which memory passively resides, as Marita Sturken has put it? Or in what ways do the modes of filming and distributing the footage contribute to the cultural memory of the first generation of post-war immigrants to Britain?

Although these clips are all available on YouTube (at least at the time writing), their modes of production and previous forms of dissemination differ to a great extent: the Windrush remediations are both TV series, clips from open access broadcasting, documentations of oral history interviews, stop-motion animations, etc. Some have been previously broadcast on public-service television, some on a (local) community channel with fairly limited audiences, others use YouTube to make school-related activities accessible to wider audiences. Therefore, the look of the clips can range from professional to amateur quality of camera, sound, some have undergone a complex process of postproduction, others would merely record a testimonial witness interview. All these different modes of production and previous distribution need to be taken into account. In addition, it is important to consider that reception takes place in different sociohistorical contexts: mediated memories are actualised on a regional, local or national level."The film clips might be viewed differently by audiences in Jamaica in 1974 and in 2013, and differently again by audiences in other countries. In short, the reception of a specific film clip will vary according to the age, gender, ethnicity and personal experiences of the viewers as well as the specific emotional state that they find themselves in when watching the clip. I will now discuss some of the case studies drawn from YouTube.

LIBERATING ARCHIVAL FOOTAGE FROM ITS COLONIALIST PERSPECTIVE: "WINDRUSH STORY" (2009)

"Windrush Story" is a short (2 min. 40 sec.) user-generated video uploaded in October 2009.²¹ It reworks the Pathé footage by creating an assemblage of the archival film footage, photographs and text frames. On the soundtrack we hear Lord Kitchener's calypso "London is the Place for Me" for the duration of the whole clip. While the voice-over of the Pathé footage is deleted, the clip uses text inserts, such as "Where was this ship from?" and "Why were these people on board?" It argues that many West Indians, who had fought alongside white Britons during WWII, would have to face racism while settling in Britain. In a didactic manner the video ends with questions such as "Why were these British men and women treated in this way?" or "What were their experiences of coming to Britain?"

The "Windrush story" video is an example of the way the Pathé footage has been reworked and – at least partly – liberated from its Eurocentric perspective. Still, it is not restricted to an exclusively Black speaking position. It refrains from referring to the immigrants in terms of "us" or "our ancestors", rather using terms such as "these people" which both distance the viewer from the migrants, while at the same time providing a broader scope of spectatorship positions. The use of the cheerful calypso performed by Lord Kitchener (this time not a cappella, but in the version of the studio recording) clearly gives the West Indian immigrants a form of agency by creating a 'point of audition' ('point d'écoute', Chion 1994) based on Black cultural practice. This mode of empowerment, however, is undermined by the textual commentary which deprives the immigrants of their agency by making them mere victims of British racism.

FROM SOCIAL PROBLEM TO ASSET: KITCH ~ "LONDON".....

The short (01:11) clip entitled "Kitch ~ "London"....." is an example of a user-generated upload which stems from a VHS-recording of a TV programme.²² The clip consists mainly of an excerpt from the

²¹ The video was uploaded by the signature "mrgreen1066" who has published 300 videos online, most of them on historical topics. With over 15,000 hits in August 2013, the "Windrush Story" is clearly one of the most successful of his uploads. <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LZf0HnnT6ZE> (07-11-2013)

²² The clip was uploaded by the signature "TVybe" on December 11th, 2008. The description reads: "Lord Kitchener a master of his craft, one of my favourite Calypsonians. this clip is lifted from the superb Great British

Channel 4 documentary “The Great Black British Invasion”, originally broadcast in a prime time slot, on Saturday 5th August 2006 at 7.25 pm. The first nine seconds of the clip consist of a user-generated title sequence (white letters on a blue background) announcing “Lord Kitchener – King of Calypso”, before we hear a cheerful female voice-over stating: “The Afro-Caribbean servicemen who found a new life in Britain soon wrote home telling others there was plenty of work here. In the late 40s a steady stream of young men began to arrive from all the islands, but it was no surprise who stole the limelight...” Now the Lord Kitchener clip from the Pathé newsreel is inserted. His a capella rendition of the calypso “London is the Place for Me” is fading over to the recorded version which plays on during an animated sequence in which the route of a Trinidadian entertainer from the Caribbean to Britain is shown on a map. The mickey-mousing on the soundtrack, while the drawn figure of the entertainer is speedily moved from Trinidad to Britain, adds to the cheerful atmosphere. The voice-over continues: “entertainers, many from Trinidad, would be the next migrants. They brought with them enough colour, excitement and style to make Britain smile again.”

In this clip the newsreel footage is reappropriated in order to rework the narrative of Black migration to Britain. Instead of migrants being depicted as a social problem or a potential threat, the clip establishes a story of migration which sees the Caribbean presence in Britain as an asset (bringing “colour, excitement and style” and uplifting the desolate nation). This is a new version of the Windrush myth, which is a result of the changed political discourse in the late 1990s. This discourse also brought about changes in pedagogy and in politics of diversity.

CREATING DIVERSITY THROUGH THE WINDRUSH MYTH: “THE EMPIRE WINDRUSH - THE DEIGHTON CENTRE ANIMATIONS”

The short (02:10) YouTube clip entitled “The Empire Windrush - The Deighton Centre Animations”²³ is described as follows: “To celebrate Black History Month, children at the Deighton Centre, Huddersfield, made short stop-motion animation films of influential Black role-models, as part of the PBCA workshop – ‘Director for a Day’.” This short animation does not use any of the Pathé footage,

Black Invasion documentary aired on Channel 4 in 2006. (My first VHS post!!!) (Plenty more to follow...) Enjoy (:” <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TReqlteRp7c> (2013-11-07)

²³ <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MOVuXMMl2kc> (07-11-2013)

but looks at the journey of the Windrush as a means to carve out a discursive space that allows for diversity by opening up the point of identification and integrating local and regional memories (Yorkshire) as well as global sounds (salsa) into the narrative. Since its upload on 18.11.2011 it has reached about 2000 hits. It was uploaded by a user called Barry Skillin, who seems to work with stop-motion animation commissioned by different schools because his other uploads deal with the same subject. Obviously he uses his uploads as part of public relations.

The clip is a mixture of black and white archival photographs as well as color landscape photography, showing both iconic tropical landscapes (beach, palm-trees) and English scenery (Yorkshire) as well as stop-motion animation with plasticine figures. The Deighton Centre is a multi-purpose centre, situated in Huddersfield, West Yorkshire, which might explain the use of landscape photography in which "England" equals the Yorkshire dales. In the intro we see photographic stills of a tropical landscape which we cannot locate exactly, dubbed with Salsa music. The use of salsa, which might be the result of Eurocentrism, indicates that the point obviously has not been to create a notion of authenticity. For instance, the plasticine figures in their hippie outfits look rather like characters from a 1970s Ken Russell film than the well-dressed men in their suits and hats we know from the newsreel footage.

The clip does not use any voice-over commentary. Instead some written text briefly explains the context before we hear children's voices dubbing the figures in an animated sequence with a number of clay figures, using one of the photographs in the background. On the soundtrack we hear a short dialogue sequence: "It's lovely and warm here." "Why are we going to England?" "To get a wide education obviously" (spoken in contemporary urban English). The figures disperse. A text insert explains: "The MV Empire is a ship that is an important part of multiracialism in the UK." The cheerful salsa fades out and gives way to a more melancholic music accompanying a sequence of black and white photographs of the Windrush generation. Inserted are animated scenes showing a boat on the sea, a map pointing out the route from the Caribbean to Tilbury. Another text frame explains that the Empire Windrush landed in Tilbury carrying 492 passengers "wishing to start a new life in the UK". The animated figures (more hippie-style): "It's so cold." "Hoo!" "Really cold." "Wish I were back in Jamaica." The clip ends with a sequence of landscape images showing Yorkshire.

In animating the migrants, they acquire a voice of their own. Their journey is depicted not only on arrival to Britain, but their home countries are shown as attractive locations which rather remind us of iconic holiday images and which therefore nobody would want to leave voluntarily. The text insert shows how embedded the film is in the hegemonic discourse about the Windrush as the foundation

myth of multicultural Britain – and as a point of common reference for a diverse group of pupils. For the names of the three young filmmakers listed in the credits - Komal Bains, Jasmin Collins, Usma Javaid - suggest how the Windrush topos is now used in a pedagogy directed at diversity, with the goal to include pupils from various cultural background, both Black British and British Asian alike. The clip is an example how Black History Month, which has been celebrated in Britain since 1987, is a trigger for reworking cultural migrant memory.

An example for televised memory triggered by anniversaries is the YouTube-clip “Sixty years on - the Windrush legacy”, uploaded by BBC Midlands Today, the YouTube channel of the BBC’s regional news programme for the West Midlands, based in Birmingham. The short clip (02:44 min), uploaded on the 23rd of June in 2008, has had over 7000 hits.²⁴ The YouTube channel announces it as follows: “It was a momentous moment in history. June the 22nd 1948 saw nearly 500 West Indians arrive for a new life in Britain. Some of the passengers on board the Empire Windrush would settle here in the West Midlands. Sixty years on, Genelle Aldred has been assessing how much life has changed for Black Britons - and what the future may hold.” The reggae music employed in the clip situates the point of audition within Black cultural practice, and, unlike calypso, is set out to include a younger urban audience.

These are just a few examples of the way YouTube is used to rework the cultural memory of migration. As a tendency we can find clips that are the result of anniversaries, of Black History Month, of didactic ambitions. We find televised clips or user-generated material, or clips from television recordings with additional user-generated material. However, we should not only ask what motivated the production of these films or videos, but also what motivated their upload on YouTube. Motivations can range from pedagogical / didactic interest to advertising or the wish to share experiences which have hitherto not been acknowledged, such as an outspokenly Christian perspective.²⁵ And, of course, all

²⁴ The number of hits refers to the time of writing, that is August 2013.

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ycNTamNIGog> (07-11-2013)

²⁵ An example for the latter would be the clip called “Windrush Legacy” which was uploaded 30.06.2013 and has reached 15 hits by August 2013. It is described as follows: “On 22nd June 1948 the Windrush docked at Tilbury. Now many of those who arrived in that era are in their late 70s + and in the next decade many of them will die taking their history with them. The white British people who saw the Windrush generation arrive are similarly well advanced in years and they too will die and take their history with them. While numerous book

of these reasons might overlap. YouTube provides us with an archive of different versions of cultural memory and allows us, at least partly, to obtain a diachronic view of the most recent changes in the visual archive, especially for the last decade.

CONCLUSION

As cultural memory studies have hitherto mostly focussed on film as a popular medium (feature films and prime time documentary) this paper has (hopefully) shown that the relation between documentary images and cultural memory needs to be theorized more fully. Two concepts which have proved highly useful are the notions of 'archive' and 'remediation'.

In order to understand the dynamics of remediation, we have to look at a) the mediation/mediatization of memory, its media specificity, its genre, at b) the politics of representation at work, and at c) the industrial context (production, distribution and exhibition).

Remediation seems to be a precondition for images to become part of working cultural memory. Yet, remediation does not occur haphazardly, but is the result of changing discourses which might carve out a space for the articulation of certain memories. The examples analysed in this paper have shown how remediation needs to be examined not only from the perspective of iconography, narrative or genre, but that the discursive context has to be reconsidered as well: a readiness to let these images become part of the visual archive and thus part of cultural memory. One important incentive for remediation can stem from the institutional context defined by political interests which initiate commemorative events. Both a general and political interest in acknowledging and celebrating these commemorative events, which for instance are triggered by anniversaries, can lead to increased funding for documentaries, especially TV productions, and exhibitions, but also for the publication of non-fiction, novels, or the staging of plays. For instance, the institutionalisation of anniversaries

and documentaries have been made about the Windrush generation and response of the white British to their arrival, as far as I am aware no visual resource exists documenting the experience of Caribbeans and White British people from a Christian perspective." The clip shows testimonial witnesses who express the importance of Christian faith in order to endure the hardships of the migrant experience. <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JwoT5u5GII> (07-11-2013)

usually results in a wider media coverage. The increased production and circulation of film and other media in turn will most likely lead to more remediations which will keep the cultural memory alive.

The second aspect looks at the reworking of colonial/Eurocentric modes of the archive. As this paper has shown, the remediation of archival footage can function as a critical interrogation into the visual archive. The same footage can be used to tie into completely different narratives: from illustrating a threat to the nation to becoming a symbol for celebrating multicultural Britain. For many Black Britons (and others) the footage had another meaning than the one prescribed: despite being employed in racifying discourses, the footage could at the same time be interpreted as an archival trace of Black life in Britain. Reworking the archive can contribute to challenging hegemonic representation, but also to questioning colonial and Eurocentric perspectives. The archive has been translated and reworked in order to fulfil two functions which are interrelated: a) to become part of a national narrative promoting diversity and celebrating Britain as a multi-cultural society, and b) carving out a discursive space for the story and legacy of Black Britain in order to compensate for the absences of images and stories in the archive of Black life in Britain. Critical interrogations into the archive can reflect on the construction of cultural memory: they can create alternative and vernacular memories without lapsing into essentialism – in doing so, they are offering emancipatory potential instead of stabilizing essentialist notions of belonging.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Assmann, A. (2008). Canon and Archive. In: Erll, Astrid and Ansgar Nünning (eds): *Cultural Memory Studies: An International and Interdisciplinary Handbook*. Berlin: de Gruyter, 97-107.
- Assmann, A. (2011). *Cultural memory and Western civilization: functions, media, archives*. 1st English ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press [Orig: Erinnerungsräume]
- Auguiste, R. (2007a). Handsworth Songs: Some Background Notes [1988]. In: Eshun/ Sagar 2007, 156-157.
- Bolter, J. D. & Grusin, R. (1999). *Remediation: understanding new media*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press
- Brunow, D. (2011). Deconstructing Essentialism and Revising Historiography: The Function of Metareference in Black British Filmmaking. In: Werner Wolf, ed. in collaboration with Katharina Bantleon and Jeff Thoss: *The Metareferential Turn in Contemporary Arts and Media: Forms, Functions, Attempts at Explanation*. Studies in Intermediality 5. Amsterdam/New York, NY: Rodopi: 341-355.
- Chion, M. (1994). *Audio-Vision*. New York: Columbia University Press
- Dabydeen, D., Gilmore, J. & Jones, C. (eds.) (2007). *The Oxford companion to Black British history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press

- Derrida, J. (1995). *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression*. Chicago/London: University of Chicago Press
- Erl, A. & Wodianka S. (Hrsg.) (2008). *Film und kulturelle Erinnerung: Plurimediale Konstellationen*. Berlin/New York: de Gruyter (=MCM 9)
- Erl, A. (2009). Remembering across Time, Space and Cultures: Premediation, Remediation and the "Indian Mutiny". in Erl, A. and Rigney, A. (Eds.), *Mediation, Remediation, and the Dynamics of Cultural Memory*, Berlin/New York: de Gruyter, pp. 109-138.
- Erl, A. & Rigney A. (2009). *Mediation, Remediation, and the Dynamics of Cultural Memory*. Berlin/New York: de Gruyter (=MCM 10)
- Erl, A. (2011a). *Memory in culture*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Erl, Astrid (2011b). Travelling Memory. *Parallax* vol 17, no 4: 4-18.
- Erl, A. & Rigney A. (2009). *Mediation, Remediation, and the Dynamics of Cultural Memory*. Berlin/New York: de Gruyter (=MCM 10)
- Fossati, G. (2009). *From grain to pixel: the archival life of film in transition*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press
- Foucault, M. (1972). *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. London/New York: Routledge
- Garde-Hansen, J. (2011). *Media and memory*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press
- Hall, S. (1991). Reconstruction Work: Images of Post-War Black Settlement. In: Spence, Jo & Patricia Holland. *Family Snaps*. London: Virago, 152-164.
- Hesse, B. (2000). Diasporicity. Black Britain's Post-Colonial Formations. In Hesse, Barnor (ed): *Un/settled multiculturalisms: diasporas, entanglements, "transruptions"*. London: Zed, 96-120.
- Korte, B., Pirker, U. E. (2011): *Black History - White History. Britain's Historical Programme between Windrush and Wilberforce*. Bielefeld: Transcript
- Kuhn, A. (2002). *Family Secrets. Acts of Memory and Imagination*. [1995] New Edition. London/New York: Verso
- Malik, S. (2002). *Representing Black Britain. A History of Black and Asian Images on British Television*. London/Thousand Oaks/Delhi: Sage
- Mead, M. (2007). Empire Windrush: Cultural memory and archival disturbance. *Moveable Type* 3: 112-28.
- Mead, M. (2009). Empire Windrush: The cultural memory of an imaginary arrival. *The Journal of Postcolonial Writing* 45.2: 137-149.
- Phillips, M. & Phillips T. (1998). *Windrush. The Irresistible Rise of Multi-Racial Britain*. London: Harper Collins
- Rigney, A. (2012). *The Afterlives of Walter Scott: Memory on the Move*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Rothberg, M. (2009). *Multidirectional Memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonization*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

- Schulze-Engler, F. (2008). Introduction. In: Schulze-Engler, Frank and Sissy Helff (eds.): *Cross/Cultures – Readings in the Post/Colonial Literatures in English*, Volume 102: Transcultural English Studies: Theories, Fictions, Realities. Amsterdam: Rodopi.
- Schwarz, B. (2007). The Legacy of Slavery and Emancipation: Jamaica in the Atlantic World. *Proceedings of the Ninth Annual Gilder Lehrman Center International Conference at Yale University*. Online (last access 10-10-2013)
- Shohat, E. & Stam, R. (1994). *Unthinking Eurocentrism: Multiculturalism and the Media*. London/New York: Routledge
- Snickars, P. & Vonderau P. (eds) (2009). *The YouTube Reader*. London: Wallflower Press
- Spence, L. & Navarro V. (2011). *Crafting Truth. Documentary Form and Meaning*. New Brunswick, New Jersey and London: Rutgers University Press
- Sturken, M. (1997). *Tangled memories: the Vietnam War, the AIDS epidemic, and the politics of remembering*. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press
- Van Dijck, J. (2007). *Mediated Memories in the Digital Age*. Stanford: Stanford UP
- Welsch, W. (1999). Transculturality – the Puzzling Form of Cultures Today. in: Featherstone, Michael and Scott Lash (eds.): *Spaces of Culture: City, Nation, World*. London: Sage, 194-213.